

---

## **APPENDIX 2**

### **ISSUES RAISED DURING COMMUNITY CONSULTATION AND PROPONENT RESPONSES**

---



## APPENDIX 2

### ISSUES RAISED DURING COMMUNITY CONSULTATION AND PROPONENT RESPONSES

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
General Waroona community	Water for future needs in the local community.	<p>The Water and Rivers Commission is responsible for the sustainable allocation of the State's water resources. As part of the allocation process, the Commission takes into consideration environmental water provisions, local needs and future development needs in the area.</p> <p>At the community open evening on the 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2002, representatives from WRC and SWI made presentations on allocation issues from a regulatory and irrigators perspective.</p>
	Waroona is paying for the inefficient use of water in Perth.	The Water Corporation has a program aimed at increasing the efficiency of water use in metropolitan homes and long term targets for reduced per capita consumption. The city is growing; therefore it follows that it will need more water, even if water use efficiency is improved.
	Alternative sources: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Kimberley</li> <li>• Murray River</li> <li>• Woodman Point</li> </ul>	<p>It is not a cost-effective solution to providing water – it would cost between \$10 and \$15 billion or \$5 per kL.</p> <p>The water from the Murray is not good quality potable water.</p> <p>The water that is disposed to sea at Woodman Point is treated wastewater, which is unsuitable for potable supply. The Corporation is, however, pursuing projects relating to the industrial use of this water. Reuse of treated wastewater (for compatible uses) is strongly supported by the Corporation. In the South West Region, these uses include irrigation of golf courses and woodlots.</p>
	Pipeline – reinstatement of land.	Full rehabilitation of disturbed areas and landowners can subsequently use the land for above surface activity.
	Pipeline - Landcare measures during construction.	There will be ongoing consultation with landowners and landcare groups.
	Redevelopment of Samson alone won't solve the problems in Perth, especially if the drought continues.	Redevelopment of Samson is only one aspect of the Water Corporation's drought response strategy.

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Trout fishing and marroning after redevelopment.	Fishing and marroning will be prohibited in the area upstream of the new pipehead dam. Mitigation measures have been suggested in the Water Source Protection Plan for Samson Brook catchment.  Trout fishing downstream of the proposed pipehead dam will not be impacted by the Water Source Protection Plan. Access to the brook in this vicinity will be subject to landowner consent (as per the current situation).
	Munda Biddi mountain bike trail – Waroona Loop.	The trail will still be constructed, but provisions should be made so that there is no access to the water.
	Public access to the wall of the main Samson Dam for recreation.	Access to the wall of the main dam will not be permitted. The presence of people in the vicinity of the reservoir presents a water quality risk due to the absence of public toilet facilities.
	Protection of the Waroona Town Water Supply during construction of the proposed pipehead dam & associated works.	The offtake for the Waroona and Hamel Town Water Supply will be relocated. A temporary coffer dam will be established upstream of the construction site.
	People with “local knowledge” working on proposal.	Regional staff from government agencies are involved. Local businesses can potentially become involved in the developmental stages.
	Local membership of Stakeholder Liaison Group	The membership of this group was necessarily wide, and included 7 local representatives (Mr Kevin O'Connor, Cr Kris Annane/Cr Hull, Mr Vernon Pitter, Ms Sharon Piscioneri, Mr Joe Walley, Mr Doug Perrett, Ms Kim Wilson).
	Water quality and analysis	The Water Corporation is required to carry out water quality monitoring as a part of their operating licence. Additionally, SWIMCo is in its second year of an intensive water quality monitoring program and Alcoa also have a water quality monitoring program in the catchment.
	Radioactive emissions from Alcoa getting into water supply.	Water Corporation monitoring results indicate that radioactive elements and heavy metals in the water at Samson Brook are well below drinking water guideline values and do not represent a hazard to public health.
	Alcoa's rehabilitation practices. Newly planted forest uses more water than mature forest.	This issue has been referred to the Mine Management Planning Liaison Group for discussion at their next meeting (scheduled for October 2002).  Attendees of the May community evening were offered the opportunity to attend a tour of Alcoa's Willowdale mining and rehabilitation operation in the Samson Brook catchment.

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Dam type.	The dam will be a concrete gravity dam.
	Damage to the newly restored Buller Road.	There would be three pipeline crossings only, so three scars left by the pipeline.
	Dust from heavy vehicle movements along Buller & James Rd during pipeline construction.	Dust is not anticipated to be a problem along these roads. They are sealed roads and there is thus very little potential for dust generation due to heavy vehicle movements. The Corporation will work closely with landowners, and will take necessary measures to ensure that dust is managed appropriately. If required, water tankers will be brought in to water the roads.
	Noisy scrub birds.	The fauna survey of the property where the dam will be located stated that the site is not suitable habitat for the Noisy Scrub-bird because there is not enough dense vegetation (Hart Simpson & Associates, 2001).
	Noisy scrub birds – impact of blasting	It is not expected that any blasting at the site will impact on the Noisy scrub bird. Most native birds can adapt to an increase in noise. Alcoa's mining operations, which include blasting, have been carried out in proximity to Noisy Scrub Bird release sites, with the birds persisting in the area (Hart, R and Dunks. A. 2002, pers. comm. 27 June).
EPA	Dam site with FSL at 180 m AHD is above Seymour Falls.	This site was not investigated further..
Alcoa World Alumina, Australia	Applications for water allocation by industry or agriculture are unlikely to be successful if they are against the people's water supply.	Water is allocated by the Water and Rivers Commission – the Water Corporation does not make these decisions.
	Alcoa has Surface Water Licenses for the Wagerup Refinery in the Samson Brook South Drain	<p>The Water and Rivers Commission have advised that the majority of the Wagerup refinery allocation is sourced from Black Tom Brook and the unnamed tributary immediately north of this and therefore is not impacted by the Samson Brook Redevelopment Proposal.</p> <p>Alcoa's allocation from the Samson South Drain expires prior to implementation of the Samson Brook Redevelopment Proposal, and Alcoa have advised that this allocation is not at issue here.</p>

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Alcoa's Surface Water Operating Strategy documents the need to maintain flows down Samson North Drain to meet EWRs for the section of the Samson North drain below Alcoa's property to the Harvey River.	EWRs for the Samson North Drain, developed by Streamtec 2001, have been taken into consideration in the development of EWPs between the Samson Dam and the Harvey River. The EWRs that were identified in 2001, and are referred to in Alcoa's Surface Water Operating Strategy, will be replaced by the EWPs in this document.
Conservation Council of WA	Conservation Covenant for Lot 6.	The Water Corporation will address this after the land transfer is finalised.
	Fauna access around inundation area. Riparian corridor for bandicoot migration.	<p>Although no definite evidence was found that the Southern Brown Bandicoot is still present along Samson Brook, it may well still occur nearby and could be present at times in small numbers.</p> <p>The strip of dense vegetation along the brook is very narrow and is not continuous. It never exceeds 20 m and probably averages only 5 m. In total the habitat quality is only moderate.</p>
	Orchids were not flowering during December flora survey.	Noted. An additional flora survey will be taken prior to construction.
	Revegetation demonstration area along McKnoe and Drakes Brook for dairy farmers.	Raised as part of the Environmental Water Provisions Desired Future State process. There is potential for the Harvey River Restoration Trust funds to be used in this area.
	Impact on vegetation of dam further upstream.	This impact would be both from the pipeline construction, dam construction site and access roads, and have been taken into consideration when reaching the preferred dam site option.
Crossing the Boundaries	Money spent for a week's worth of water for Perth – cultural change in water use needed.	The Water Corporation has a program aimed at increasing the efficiency of water use in metropolitan homes already. Developing water sources does cost a lot of money.
	Mitigation: fencing Samson Brook to protect vegetation.	Raised as part of the Environmental Water Provisions Desired Future State process. There is potential for the Harvey River Restoration Trust funds to be used in this area.
	Environmental impacts of pipeline and dam should be considered equally.	They have both been considered and will be addressed.
	Pipeline route and disturbance of vegetation.	<p>Design of route has minimised vegetation disturbance. Disturbed areas will be rehabilitated.</p> <p>Water Corporation walked the route of the pipeline along Buller Road with Crossing the Boundaries (on behalf landcare community) to identify route of least impact to roadside vegetation. Mitigation package includes translocating grass trees impacted by pipeline construction.</p>

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Scarp Road closure.	Scarp Road will not be closed. Measures will be taken to prevent contamination of Samson Brook by activity along Scarp Road.
	Jarrah forest recreational value.	Recreation in Samson Brook catchment will be prohibited (except along the Munda Bidli Trail), but there are no plans to develop Drakes Brook Dam or Waroona Dam for supply. Scarp Road will remain open and provides for a scenic drive.
	Tapping into new supply by landowners.	The Corporation held a meeting of landowners potentially impacted by the pipeline route on 17 <sup>th</sup> December 2001. Indicative costs for connection to a poly pipe water supply were provided to meeting attendees, and the forum was used to gauge the level of interest amongst landowners in connecting to such a water supply.  Whilst the Corporation has not yet reached a final determination on this issue, it is likely that a poly pipe (water supply) will be provided along the James Rd section of the pipeline route.  It was noted that a year-round supply could not be guaranteed, even if a poly pipe were to be provided.
	Community unfamiliar with EPS process.	There has been regular community consultation to familiarise the community with the EPS process.
Shire of Waroona	Quality of road reinstatement along Buller Road.	The pipeline alignment minimises road disturbance such that only three crossings are necessary.
	Mitigation measures: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tourism Recreation Plan for Waroona.</li> <li>• Survey and gazette Scarp Road.</li> </ul>	The Corporation has considered the potential mitigation measures raised during the consultation process and has committed to the development of a recreation plan for the Waroona/Drakes brook system.
	Effect of SWIMCo's piped irrigation system on ecology.	Addressed via compliance requirement for the Environmental Water Provisions.
	The Samson Brook Redevelopment Scheme is just a bandaid.	The Samson Brook scheme is not designed to be a bandaid, but a component of the integrated supply system. Previously, development was timetabled for 2007, although this has been brought forward, as one part of the drought response program.
Health Department of WA	Flow rates and holding times of reservoir.	Will be addressed in the Water Corporation Operating Strategy.
	Barriers to pollution in the system.	Will be addressed in the Water Corporation Operating Strategy.
Recfishwest	Secondary treatment in the future.	Allowance has been made for a water treatment plant in the design.

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Mitigation measures at Harvey are not being implemented. Concern that this will happen at Samson.	<p>The Corporation has committed to contribute to the development of a recreation plan, which will identify opportunities for enhancement of recreational facilities outside of the Samson Brook catchment area. Funding and responsibilities for implementation of enhanced recreation facilities will be formalised in a "Memorandum of Understanding" between the Shire of Waroona and the Water Corporation.</p> <p>The Corporation's project manager has been involved in the stakeholder consultation process for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Environmental impact assessment;</li> <li>• Determination of Environmental Water Provisions; and</li> <li>• Water Source Protection Planning.</li> </ul> <p>This has ensured that the project team is familiar with the issues &amp; concerns associated with each process, the mitigation measures agreed, and the Corporation's responsibility to deliver mitigation measures.</p>
Aboriginal community	Safeguard rivers for future generations.	Determination of the Environmental Water Provisions for the system ensures that the ecological, social and economic values are addressed.
Stakeholder Liaison Group	Unnatural flows down Samson Brook.	Flows during summer would be mitigation flows to compensate for the sedimented pools.
	Upstream and downstream fish populations.	These populations are genetically distinct.
SWIC	Waroona Dam - other groups (not only SWI) should be recognised as beneficiaries of dam safety works	Relates to dam safety remedial works and these negotiations are considered separately.
Department of Fisheries, Recfishwest and the WA Trout and Freshwater Fishing Association	Concern that the Water Corporation is gradually encroaching on all of their fishing resources.	Consultation of offset package.
	<p>Loss of recreational fishing and marroning amenity. Offsets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Destocking marron in drinking water supply dams.</li> <li>• Limit trout and marron season to the time when the least demand is placed on Samson Dam for drinking water supply.</li> <li>• Fish grid on spillway at Drakes Brook Weir to prevent fish going over the spillway.</li> <li>• Fund the cost of stocking trout in available dams in Waroona/Harvey area.</li> <li>• Construct habitat enhancement at Waroona Dam.</li> </ul>	<p>These issues have been acknowledged in the Water Source Protection Plan for Samson Brook catchment. Suggestions for offsets have been made in this WSPP.</p> <p>The Water Corporation is waiting for fish grid designs from the Fisheries Department. This will be considered in the context of dam safety.</p>



Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
	Risk of contamination from fishing vs Alcoa's mining activity.	Alcoa has an undertaking with the State Government to protect water resources in all of the catchment areas in which it operates, or has operated. Therefore, mining in this catchment is a managed risk.
General Waroona Community/ Shire of Waroona.	Spraying of weeds on the dam property.	The Declared plants have been identified and should it be that the Water Corporation include the Corvaia property in the redevelopment, we will ensure that management of <i>Gomphocarpus fruticosus</i> and <i>Solanum linnaenum</i> is carried out according to the provisions of the Agriculture and Related Resources Protection Act
	Concern that allocation for irrigation will be lost.	The Water Corporation's proposal does not impact on SWIC's licensed allocation. The project will create opportunities for water allocations licences to be traded. The water allocation and trading process is managed by the Water and Rivers Commission, and any trading of licences is a consultative process where both parties must agree.
	Supply to Waroona change as a result of redevelopment.	The offtake will move to the new pipehead dam location. The amount of water allocated to the Waroona Town Water Supply Scheme will remain unchanged. The water will receive the same treatment at the same location as the Perth water.
	Same level of water restrictions for Waroona as Perth when Samson goes on line.	A capacity sharing model (like that used for Harris) will be used, where water is reserved for local needs. The town be subject to water restrictions only if Waroona water use approaches or exceeds its allocation.
General Waroona Community/ Crossing the Boundaries	Repair of Waroona Dam.	This is in the process of being repaired. It was drained because an investigation of lower parts of the dam was required. It is scheduled to be repaired in October 2002. Community impacts will be assessed and offsets will be developed.
	Waroona community respects Samson Brook and acts to ensure the water quality. Contamination by non community members. Apparent inconsistency in permitted catchment uses between country water supply catchments and metropolitan water supply catchments.	Currently the catchment is gazetted under the Country Areas Water Supply Act, 1914, which prohibits pollution, but does not specifically exclude fishing from the catchment. Fishing and marroning activities do pose a risk to water quality, and are prohibited under the Metropolitan Water Supply, Sewerage and Drainage Act, 1947.
Conservation Council of WA/ Crossing the Boundaries	Loss of significant vegetation on McClure Road by pipeline disturbance.	The preferred route is to the north, so there will be no disturbance to this vegetation.

Stakeholder	Issue raised	Response
Crossing the Boundaries/ Recfishwest.	New Pipehead dam would intercept fallen leaves, therefore carbon transport downstream. The north-eastern tributary is important to downstream ecology and should not be captured by the dam.	The importance of carbon transport is recognised. To allow this to still occur to some extent, the dam will be situated upstream of the north-eastern tributary.
	Fishladders.	There is no need for a fishladder at the new pipehead dam. This is because the upstream and downstream fish populations are genetically distinct as obstacles in Samson Brook prevent fish migration.
Alcoa World Alumina, Australia/ Health Department of WA	The impact of this development on the Peel Harvey Estuary is not covered in the EWR.	The impact is discussed in the Environmental Protection Statement. Flows into the Peel Harvey will not be altered from the pre-European flow regime. Additionally, whilst diversion of this "hills water" reduces the volume of high quality water flowing through to the Peel-Harvey Estuary, reduction of flow through the drainage channels of the Swan Coastal Plain increases the opportunity for on-site metabolism of nutrients sourced from agricultural land-uses.
Alcoa World Alumina, Australia/ Shire of Waroona	Resource will become inaccessible for future development.	Other resources such as Drakes Brook and Waroona Dams are not planned for water supply, so will still be accessible.